

Mr Braithwaite. Pringle Head 5 Pringle Bank Warton Carnforth LA5 9PW

Decision date: 26 October 2023

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACTS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2013

Change of use from residential to short term let for 100 nights in a calendar year. At 29B Walker Street Edinburgh EH3 7HX

Application No: 23/03697/FULSTL

DECISION NOTICE

With reference to your application for Planning Permission STL registered on 5 September 2023, this has been decided by **Local Delegated Decision**. The Council in exercise of its powers under the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Acts and regulations, now determines the application as **Refused** in accordance with the particulars given in the application.

Any condition(s) attached to this consent, with reasons for imposing them, or reasons for refusal, are shown below;

Reason for Refusal:-

1. The proposal is contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Hou 7 in respect of Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas, as the use of this property as a short term let will have a materially detrimental effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents.

2. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework 4 Policy 30(e) in respect of Local Amenity and Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will result in an unacceptable impact on local amenity and the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

Please see the guidance notes on our <u>decision page</u> for further information, including how to appeal or review your decision.

Drawings 01 - 02, represent the determined scheme. Full details of the application can be found on the <u>Planning and Building Standards Online Services</u>

The reason why the Council made this decision is as follows:

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the City as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or the loss of residential accommodation.

The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

This determination does not carry with it any necessary consent or approval for the proposed development under other statutory enactments.

Should you have a specific enquiry regarding this decision please contact Craig Turnbull directly at craig.turnbull@edinburgh.gov.uk.

Chief Planning Officer PLACE The City of Edinburgh Council

NOTES

1. If the applicant is aggrieved by the decision to refuse permission for or approval required by a condition in respect of the proposed development, or to grant permission or approval subject to conditions, the applicant may require the planning authority to review the case under section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 within three months beginning with the date of this notice. The Notice of Review can be made online at www.eplanning.scot or forms can be downloaded from that website. Paper forms should be addressed to the City of Edinburgh Planning Local Review Body, G.2, Waverley Court, 4 East Market Street, Edinburgh, EH8 8BG. For enquiries about the Local Review Body, please email localreviewbody@edinburgh.gov.uk.

2. If permission to develop land is refused or granted subject to conditions and the owner of the land claims that the land has become incapable of reasonably beneficial use in its existing state and cannot be rendered capable of reasonably beneficial use by carrying out of any development which has been or would be permitted, the owner of the land may serve on the planning authority a purchase notice requiring the purchase of the owner of the land's interest in the land accordance with Part 5 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

Report of Handling

Application for Planning Permission STL 29B Walker Street, Edinburgh, EH3 7HX

Proposal: Change of use from residential to short term let for 100 nights in a calendar year.

Item – Local Delegated Decision Application Number – 23/03697/FULSTL Ward – B11 - City Centre

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Refused** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposal complies with Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed building or its setting and it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The change of use of this property to a short term let (STL) will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the City as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or the loss of residential accommodation.

The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The application property is a three bedroom basement flat located in a four storey building on the corner of Walker Street and Drumsheugh Gardens.

The property comprises a living room, kitchen, bathroom, and three bedrooms and is accessed via steps leading down from street level to its own main door entrance. The property has its own outdoor space at basement level of the building.

The property is located in The New Town Conservation Area and Edinburgh's World Heritage Site. It also forms a part of a Category B listed building (ref: LB28674: date of listing 14.12.1970).

The surrounding area of the property comprises a mix of residential and office uses.

Description Of The Proposal

The application seeks permission to change the residential use to a short term let visitor accommodation for 100 nights in a calendar year. No internal or external physical changes are proposed.

Supporting Information

Two supporting statements.

Relevant Site History No relevant site history.

Other Relevant Site History

23/05843/CLESTL 29 Walker Street New Town Edinburgh EH3 7HX Application for the issue of a Certificate of Lawfulness confirming its existing use as a short-term let visitor accommodation. Application received

23/05802/CLESTL 27 Walker Street Edinburgh EH3 7HX Application for the issue of a certificate of lawfulness confirming its existing use as a short-term let visitor accommodation. Application received

As detailed above, applications have been submitted for property immediately neighbouring the application site in relation to proposed short term let uses. These applications are yet to be determined.

Consultation Engagement

No consultations.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: 6 September 2023 Date of Advertisement: 15 September 2023 Date of Site Notice: 15 September 2023 Number of Contributors: 0

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s) and being within a conservation area, this report will first consider the proposals in terms of Sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

a) Is there a strong presumption against granting planning permission due to the proposals:

(i) harming the listed building or its setting? or

(ii) conflicting with the objective of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the conservation area?

b) If the strong presumption against granting planning permission is engaged, are there any significant public interest advantages of the development which can only be delivered at the scheme's proposed location that are sufficient to outweigh it?

This report will then consider the proposed development under Sections 24, 25 and 37 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 (the 1997 Act):

Having regard to the legal requirement of Section 24(3), in the event of any policy incompatibility between National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) & Edinburgh Local Development Plan 2016 (LDP) the newer policy shall prevail.

Do the proposals comply with the development plan?

If the proposals do comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for not approving them?

If the proposals do not comply with the development plan, are there any compelling material considerations for approving them?

In the assessment of material considerations this report will consider:

- equalities and human rights;
- public representations; and
- any other identified material considerations.

Assessment

a) The proposals harm the listed building and its setting?

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

• Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent.

• Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interim Guidance on the principles of listed building consent sets out the principles for assessing the impact of a development on a listed building.

Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting sets out the principles that apply to developments affecting the setting of historic assets or places including listed buildings and conservation areas. It includes factors to be considered in assessing the impact of a change on the setting.

There are no external or internal alterations proposed. As such, the proposal will not have an adverse impact on or cause harm to the listed building. The setting of the listed building and the setting of neighbouring listed buildings will be unaffected by the proposal.

Conclusion in relation to the listed building

The proposal harms neither the listed building or its setting. It is therefore acceptable with regard to Section 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas)(Scotland) Act 1997.

b) The proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area?

Section 64(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 states:

"In exercise, with respect to any buildings or other land in a conservation area, of any powers under any of the provisions in subsection (2), special attention shall be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of that area."

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that it represents a planned urban concept of European significance with an overriding character of Georgian formality. Stone built terrace houses and tenements, built to the highest standards, overlook communal private gardens; to the rear are lanes with mews buildings, many of which are now in housing use. The importance of the area lies in the formal plan layout of buildings, streets, mews and gardens and in the quality of the buildings themselves.

There are no external changes proposed. The change of use from a residential premises to a short term let for 100 nights in a calendar year will not have any material impact on the character of the conservation area. The change of use would preserve the appearance of the conservation area.

Conclusion in relation to the conservation area

The proposal does not harm the conservation area. Therefore, it is acceptable with regard to Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

c) The proposals comply with the development plan?

National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) was adopted by the Scottish Ministers on 13 February 2023 and forms part of the Council's Development Plan. NPF4 policies supports the planning and delivery of Sustainable Places, Liveable Places and Productive Places and are the key policies against which proposals for development are assessed. Several policies in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP) are superseded by equivalent and alternative policies within NPF4. The relevant policies to be considered are:

- NPF4 Sustainable Places Policy 1.
- NPF4 Historic Assets and Places Policy 7.
- NPF4 Productive Places Tourism Policy 30.
- LDP Housing Policy Hou 7.
- LDP Transport Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

The non-statutory 'Listed Buildings and Conservation Area' guidance is a material consideration that is relevant when considering historic assets.

The non-statutory 'Guidance for Businesses' (2023) is a material consideration that is relevant when considering change of use applications.

Listed Buildings, Conservation Area and Edinburgh World Heritage Site

There are no external or internal works proposed and as such there will not be a significant impact on historic assets and places. The proposal complies with NPF 4 Policy 7.

Proposed Use

With regards to NPF 4 Policy 1, the proposed change of use does not involve operational development resulting in physical changes to the property. The proposals will have a negligible impact on the global climate and nature crisis.

NPF 4 Policy 30 seeks to encourage, promote and facilitate sustainable tourism development which benefits local people, is consistent with our net zero and nature commitments, and inspires people to visit Scotland. Criterion 30 (e) specifically relates to STL proposals.

LDP Policy Hou 7 (Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas), seeks to protect residential amenity.

The non-statutory Guidance for Businesses (2023) states that an assessment of a change of use of dwellings to a short term let will have regard to:

- The character of the new use and of the wider area;

- The size of the property;

- The pattern of activity associated with the use including numbers of occupants, the period of use, issues of noise, disturbance and parking demand and

- The nature and character of any services provided.

Amenity:

The property is accessed via its own main door entrance at basement level of a fourstorey building. The property is located in an area of residential and office uses. These uses are of a quiet nature and result in a moderate degree of activity during the day and a low degree of activity and ambient noise level at night time.

The applicant's supporting planning statement provides information to address NPF 4 policy 30 (e) part (i). The applicant asserts that the use by visitors would have no effect on the amenities of neighbouring residents.

Property adjoining the application site at 27 and 29 Walker Street are subject to Certificate of Lawfulness applications, in relation to proposed short term let uses, which are yet to be determined. Notwithstanding this, the current lawful planning use of the properties adjoining the application site are residential. The use of this three bedroom basement property as an STL would introduce an increased frequency of movement to the property. The proposed STL use would enable visitors to arrive and stay at the premises for a short period of time on a regular basis throughout the year in a manner dissimilar to that of permanent residents.

There is no guarantee that guests would not come and go frequently during the day and night, and transient visitors may have less regard for neighbours' amenity than individuals using the property as a principal home. The use of the property by short term visitors may have detrimental impacts on the amenity of neighbouring residents.

The additional servicing that operating a property as a STL requires compared to that of a residential use is also likely to result in an increase in disturbances, further impacting on neighbouring amenity. However, this would be of lesser impact as the property has its own main door entrance at basement level of the building and it is likely that servicing would be conducted during the daytime.

This would be significantly different from the ambient background noise that neighbouring residents might reasonably expect and will have an unacceptable effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents. The proposal does not comply with NPF 4 policy 30(e) part (i) and LDP policy Hou 7.

Loss of residential accommodation:

NPF 4 policy 30 (e) part (ii) requires that where there is a loss of residential accommodation, this will only be supported where the loss is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits.

Paragraph 220 of the LDP acknowledges that tourism is the biggest source of employment in Edinburgh, providing jobs for over 31,000 people. The use of the property by guests and the required maintenance and upkeep of STL properties are likely to result in a level of job creation and spend within the economy which can be classed as having an economic benefit.

The applicant's planning statement notes that the property would remain available for themselves and their family for the time they spend in Edinburgh and there would be no loss of residential accommodation. Additionally, the applicant notes that the payment of additional tax, in order to own a second home located in Edinburgh, is a demonstrable local economic benefit that contributes to the provision of affordable housing in Edinburgh and outweighs any perceived loss of residential accommodation. The current lawful planning use of the property is for residential accommodation. The use of the property as an STL for a period of 100 nights in a calendar year would result in a material change of use of the property leading to a loss of residential accommodation. Given the recognised need and demand for housing in Edinburgh it is important to retain, where appropriate.

Furthermore, it is important to recognise that residential occupation of the property also contributes to the economy, in terms of providing a home and the spend in relation to the use of the property as a home, including the use of local services and resultant employment, as well as by making contributions to the local community.

In this instance, it has not been sufficiently demonstrated that the loss of the residential accommodation is outweighed by demonstrable local economic benefits. As such, the proposal does not comply with NPF 4 30(e) part (ii).

Parking Standards

There is no off-street parking available at the property. Cycles could be parked inside the property. The proposals comply with LDP Policies Tra 2 and Tra 3.

Conclusion in relation to the Development Plan

The change of use of this property to an STL will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the City as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or the loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

d) There are any other material considerations which must be addressed?

The following material planning considerations have been identified:

Independent economic impact assessment

An independent economic impact assessment was commissioned by the Planning Service, and this resulted in a report on the Economic Impact of Residential and Short-Term Let Properties in Edinburgh (the Economic Report). This was reported to Planning Committee on 14 June 2023. The Committee noted that the findings of the report are one source of information that can be considered when assessing the economic impacts of short-term let planning applications and that given the report is considering generalities rather than the specifics of an individual case, it is likely that only limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration when making planning application decisions. The study considered the economic impact of various types of properties in Edinburgh if used as a residential property as opposed to being used for short-term holiday lettings.

The Economic Report shows that there are positive economic impacts from the use of properties for both residential use and short-term let use. The Report found that in

general the gross value added (GVA) effects are greater for residential uses than shortterm lets across all property types and all areas. However, given it is considering generalities rather than the specifics of this individual case, only limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

Emerging policy context

City Plan 2030 represents the settled will of the Council, and it has been submitted to Scottish Ministers for examination. As such, limited weight can be attached to it as a material consideration in the determination of this application.

Equalities and human rights

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010. No impacts have been identified.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

- None.

Conclusion in relation to identified material considerations

Identified material considerations have been assessed above and do not raise issues which outweigh the conclusion in relation to the development plan.

Overall conclusion

The proposal complies with sections 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the conservation area and does not harm the character of the listed building, its setting, or the setting of neighbouring listed buildings.

The change of use of this property to an STL will have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring amenity. The loss of the residential accommodation has not been justified. Whilst it is recognised that there is an economic benefit to the City as a whole from the provision of tourist accommodation, in this case it does not outweigh the adverse impact on residential amenity or the loss of residential accommodation. The proposal does not comply with the Development Plan policy NPF 4 policy 30(e) and LDP policy Hou 7. There are no material considerations that outweigh this conclusion. The proposal is unacceptable.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following;

Reason for Refusal

1. The proposal is contrary to Local Development Plan Policy Hou 7 in respect of Inappropriate Uses in Residential Areas, as the use of this property as a short term let will have a materially detrimental effect on the living conditions and amenity of nearby residents.

2. The proposal is contrary to National Planning Framework 4 Policy 30(e) in respect of Local Amenity and Loss of Residential Accommodation, as the use of this dwelling as a short term let will result in an unacceptable impact on local amenity and the loss of a residential property has not been justified.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the Planning Portal

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 5 September 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01 - 02

Scheme 1

David Givan Chief Planning Officer PLACE The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Craig Turnbull, Assistant Planning Officer E-mail:craig.turnbull@edinburgh.gov.uk

Appendix 1

Consultations

No consultations undertaken.

Appendix 2

Application Certification Record

Case Officer

I have assessed the application against the City of Edinburgh Council's Scheme of Delegation (2023) Appendix 6 – Chief Planning Officer and the Statutory Scheme of Delegation (2023) and can confirm the application is suitable to be determined under Local Delegated Decision, decision-making route.

Case Officer: Craig Turnbull

Date: 25 October 2023

Authorising Officer

To be completed by an officer as authorised by the Chief Planning Officer to determined applications under delegated powers.

I can confirm that I have checked the Report of Handling and agree the recommendation by the case officer.

Authorising Officer (mRTPI): Damian McAfee

Date: 25 October 2023

PROPOSED CHANGE OF USE OF PROPERTY FROM RESIDENTIAL TO A MIXED USE OF RESIDENTIAL AND SHORT TERM LETTING

at

29B WALKER STREET, EDINBURGH EH3 7HX

ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING STATEMENT

I have confirmed that the application is for use of the property for short-term letting for no more than 100 days per year; which equates to 27% of each year.

The property is accessed directly off Walker Street, via a stone staircase, and has under pavement cellars for the storage of refuse and recycling. Use of the property for 100 days per year would have no visible effect on the visual amenity or character of the area. The property is a basement flat and there are no properties beneath it. Use of the flat either by myself and my family or by visitors to Edinburgh would have no effect on the amenities of neighbouring residents. The property would remain available to myself and my family for the time we spend in Edinburgh and there would thus be no loss of residential accommodation.

I paid tax for the privilege of owning a second home in Edinburgh. This is a demonstrable local economic benefit that contributes to the provision of affordable housing in Edinburgh and outweighs any perceived loss of residential accommodation.

The proposal does not, for the above reasons, conflict with policy 30(e) of NPF4.

PROPOSED CHANGE OF USE OF PROPERTY FROM RESIDENTIAL TO A MIXED USE OF RESIDENTIAL AND SHORT TERM LETTING

at

29B WALKER STREET, EDINBURGH EH3 7HX

The property I own in Edinburgh is a three-bedroom basement flat. I and my family visit the property frequently but it is not our main residence. I intend to apply for a licence to use the property, when we are not there, as short term letting accommodation. Because the property is not where I normally live I first need to apply for planning permission to use the property for this purpose.

The flat has its own access off the pavement to Walker Street and its own underpayment cellars which are used, partially, for the storage of refuse and recycling.

Use of the property as short-term letting accommodation will contribute to the availability of such accommodation for visitors to Edinburgh and will thus contribute to the tourist economy.